



## Agenda for Overview Committee Thursday, 12th October, 2023, 6.00 pm

### Members of Overview Committee

Councillors: B Bailey, J Brown, T Dumper, P Fernley, A Hall (Chair), J Heath, V Johns, Y Levine, M Martin, C Nicholas, T Olive, H Riddell and D Wilson (Vice-Chair)

**Venue:** Council Chamber, Blackdown House, Honiton

**Contact:** Sarah James;

01395 519978 email [sjames@eastdevon.gov.uk](mailto:sjames@eastdevon.gov.uk)

(or group number 01395 517546)

Monday, 2 October 2023

East Devon District Council  
Blackdown House  
Border Road  
Heathpark Industrial Estate  
Honiton  
EX14 1EJ

DX 48808 HONITON

Tel: 01404 515616

[www.eastdevon.gov.uk](http://www.eastdevon.gov.uk)

- 1 Apologies
- 2 Minutes of the previous meeting held on 20 July 2023 (Pages 3 - 6)
- 3 Declarations of interest  
Guidance is available online to Councillors and co-opted members on making [declarations of interest](#).
- 4 Public Speaking  
Information on [public speaking](#) is available online.
- 5 Matters of urgency  
Information on [matters of urgency](#) is available online.
- 6 Confidential/exempt item(s)  
To agree any items to be dealt with after the public (including press) have been excluded. There are **no** items that officers recommend should be dealt with in this way.
- 7 Car Parking Strategy - Draft principles and objectives (Pages 7 - 10)
- 8 StreetScene Public Bin Review (Pages 11 - 16)  
To consider the report that is to go to Cabinet
- 9 Minutes of Scrutiny Committee held on 9 June 2022 (Pages 17 - 21)

To consider a recommendation from Cabinet (on 13 July 2022) that the minutes of Scrutiny Committee held on 9 June 2022 be referred to Overview Committee, to look into making further progress on the following subjects (minute 7 refers):

- To consider a petition platform within the Council's website
- To publicise the Council's petition scheme via the Council's weekly press release

#### 10 Work Programme 2023-2024 (Pages 22 - 28)

To consider additions to the work programme for the Committee.

The Cabinet Forward Plan is attached, for consideration; would the Committee wish to receive a report on key decisions prior to Cabinet?

Proposal forms received:

- For Overview to receive an update on the implementation of the new public toilet strategy and to review the direction of travel – submitted by Cllr Mike Goodman

Under the Openness of Local Government Bodies Regulations 2014, any members of the public are now allowed to take photographs, film and audio record the proceedings and report on all public meetings (including on social media). No prior notification is needed but it would be helpful if you could let the democratic services team know you plan to film or record so that any necessary arrangements can be made to provide reasonable facilities for you to report on meetings. This permission does not extend to private meetings or parts of meetings which are not open to the public. You should take all recording and photography equipment with you if a public meeting moves into a session which is not open to the public.

If you are recording the meeting, you are asked to act in a reasonable manner and not disrupt the conduct of meetings for example by using intrusive lighting, flash photography or asking people to repeat statements for the benefit of the recording. You may not make an oral commentary during the meeting. The Chair has the power to control public recording and/or reporting so it does not disrupt the meeting.

Members of the public exercising their right to speak during Public Speaking will be recorded.

[Decision making and equalities](#)

**For a copy of this agenda in large print, please contact the Democratic Services Team on 01395 517546**

**EAST DEVON DISTRICT COUNCIL****Minutes of the meeting of Overview Committee held at Council Chamber, Blackdown House, Honiton on 20 July 2023****Attendance list at end of document**

The meeting started at 6.00 pm and ended at 7.33 pm

**1 Public Speaking**

There were no members of the public registered to speak.

**2 Minutes of the previous meeting held on 21 July 2022**

The minutes of the previous meeting held on 21 July 2022 were signed as a true and accurate record.

**3 Declarations of interest**

Cllr J Brown – Minute 14; Affects Non-Registerable Interest: Member of Honiton Town Council.

**4 Matters of urgency**

There were no matters of urgency.

**5 Confidential/exempt item(s)**

There were no confidential or exempt items.

**6 Proposals for a Place and Prosperity Framework for East Devon District Council**

The Project Manager – Place and Prosperity (Exmouth) presented this report which provided Members with an update on progress with developing a new Place and Prosperity Framework.

The Framework sets out the mechanism where Place and Prosperity investment proposals will be screened against the borrowing requirements of the Public Works Loans Board (PWLB) in a standardised way, and sets out a revised governance process for agile and robust decision making.

In presentation, the following points were highlighted:

- The aim is to provide a fund through the PWLB which will allow the Council to borrow money for three key purposes; i) service delivery; ii) economic regeneration; and iii) preventative action.
- The proposed Place and Prosperity Framework addresses the opportunity to have a single fund of circa £20M investing as a first tranche borrowed from the PWLB.
- It is envisaged that the fund will be used only where, in the assessment process, it is considered that all other sources of government funding are exhausted.
- In the event of a feasible investment opportunity, a Place and Prosperity Investment Assessment Group of Officers (with the support of consultants, if necessary) will prepare

a recommendation to be considered by a Place and Prosperity Investment Assessment Board (the Board).

- It is proposed that the Board is a sub-committee of Cabinet comprising the Leader, the Portfolio Holder for Finance and the Portfolio Holder for Economy. The Board will be supported by senior officers.
- Where it is deemed necessary, consultation will take place at the full appraisal stage with members who represent the ward where the proposed investment is to be located, and with relevant Portfolio Holders.
- The Board will have authority to make decisions up to and including £5,000,000. In making a decision, the Board should be fully agreed; a decision that is not unanimous cannot proceed,
- For investment opportunities in excess of £5,000,000, the Board will need to recommend the investment to Cabinet or Council, as appropriate.

Members were asked to consider the proposed draft of the Place and Prosperity Framework and recommend any changes for consideration by Cabinet.

Discussion included the following points:

- The proposed Place and Prosperity Framework is assessed as low impact for climate change and equalities but the wider impact of any specific projects will be assessed in detail if or when those projects are developed. In assessing impacts, specialist advice will be sought where appropriate.
- The PWLB is considered a fund of last resort and attempts will always be made to first identify if grant funding is available. It was noted however that the Council might need to move swiftly in transactions, and grant funding can take some considerable time to access.
- Borrowing from the PWLB can be for up to 50 years at either index-linked or fixed rates or interest. Sensitivity analysis takes place as part of the appraisal process to assess the financial impact of repayment terms and changes in interest rates. To comply with the Prudential Code, the Council is required to put in a 'Minimum Revenue Position'; an investment vehicle such as an annuity, to safeguard for the eventuality that the Council cannot make a repayment or there is a sudden interest rate rise.
- A mechanism is in place which enables officers to carry out a quick initial assessment on whether a project is feasible, before significant time or resource is invested in taking it forward.
- There is a requirement to comply with the Prudential Code but it is for Members to decide the financial limit that the Board can approve up to. It was noted that at £5M, the proposed cap is significantly less than many other local authorities who are more versed in working in this way and delivering these types of projects. Local authorities often have to move quickly; decision making therefore needs to be agile yet robust, and officers expressed confidence that this is achieved through the proposal.
- It is for Members to decide the size and composition of the Board. Members were keen to ensure appropriate Member involvement in the decision-making process balanced against the need for strict confidentiality on the Board, so as not to compromise the Council's position in sensitive negotiations. It was noted that in one similar situation, two Members were appointed at the Leader's discretion to be non-executive observers at the Board meeting. It is understood that this worked well and whilst the non-executive members did not always agree with the Board's decision, they were always content with the robustness of the process.

**RECOMMENDED to Cabinet:**

- The Committee recommends the amendment of the Place and Prosperity Framework to reflect the addition of an additional non-executive member and recommends that the Framework proceeds to Council.

Members were of the view that the additional non-executive member to the Board should be able to enter into debate as part of the decision making process, but should not have voting rights.

## 7 **Minutes of Scrutiny Committee held on 9 March 2023**

The following recommendations from the Scrutiny Committee meeting held on 9 March 2023 were received and noted:

1. That the Council aims to complete the Leisure Strategy stock condition survey by the end of the next Council term to enable both the Council and the public to be aware of the condition of their local assets and so that the required maintenance can therefore be budgeted for.
2. In the event that a cultural or leisure site is to close as a result of the stock condition survey, a public consultation be held where possible.

## 8 **Work Programme 2023-2024**

The Chair asked the Committee to consider items for addition to the Overview Committee's work programme.

The first item for consideration was a proposal form submitted by Cllr Anne Hall regarding grass cutting in urban areas with the management of rewilding areas. It was noted that the Scrutiny Committee would be looking at this issue at its September meeting to ascertain the current position, and could refer its research to the Overview Committee. In discussion at length, Members agreed that the item should be added to the Overview Committee's work programme for scoping, with an officer's report to be expected for its November meeting.

Members also reported that there was some public misconception around the council's rationale for allowing grass to grow and it was felt that the council could better communicate with the public about the good work that it is doing.

A second item for consideration was an item referred from Council on 19 July 2023 concerning car parking payments and a preventative motion to consider not going to cashless machines. The Committee agreed to add this item to its work programme and the Parking Manager is expected to bring an initial report to the Committee's September meeting.

A third item for consideration was concerning a referral from Cabinet in July 2022 for Overview Committee to look into online petitions, and it was expected that the Monitoring Officer will bring a view on this to the Overview Committee's next meeting. At that point, the Committee will make a decision on whether to add this item to its work programme.

Finally, Members had received the Cabinet Forward Plan and were asked to consider if the Overview Committee should receive a report on key decisions prior to Cabinet. The Committee asked for a report on the StreetScene Public Bin Review and it was agreed to add this to the Committee's work programme.

The following points were noted in further discussion:

- Cllr Martin was expected to submit a proposal form concerning snares and glue traps.
- Members were keen to ensure that the issue of housing voids is being scrutinised at the appropriate committee. It was noted that scrutiny of this issue is taking place at Housing Review Board.

**Attendance List**

**Councillors present:**

J Brown  
P Fernley  
A Hall (Chair)  
J Heath  
Y Levine  
T Olive  
D Wilson (Vice-Chair)

**Councillors also present (for some or all the meeting)**

P Arnott  
I Barlow  
C Brown  
M Goodman  
M Hartnell  
N Hookway

**Officers in attendance:**

Tim Child, Assistant Director Place, Assets & Commercialisation  
Sarah James, Democratic Services Officer  
Gerry Mills, Project Manager Place & Prosperity (Exmouth)  
Anita Williams, Principal Solicitor (Deputy Monitoring Officer)

**Councillor apologies:**

B Bailey  
T Dumper  
M Martin  
C Nicholas  
H Riddell

Chair: .....

Date: .....



Report to: Overview Committee

Date of Meeting 14<sup>th</sup> September 2023

Document classification: Part A Public Document

Exemption applied: None

Review date for release N/A

## Car Parking Strategy – Draft principles and objectives

### Report summary:

Proposed Car Park Strategy Principles & Objectives

### Is the proposed decision in accordance with:

Budget Yes  No

Policy Framework Yes  No

### Recommendation:

- That the Overview committee consider and agree the proposed principles and objectives that will form the basis for EDDC's Car Parking Strategy.
- That Overview committee agree the dates of 2024 – 2031 for the time period in which the strategy will cover

### Reason for recommendation:

The draft principles and objectives will set the basis for the production the EDDC parking strategy, which will in-turn act as the published approach to managing our car parks over the coming years.

Officer: Richard Easthope, Parking Services Manager – [reasthope@eastdevon.gov.uk](mailto:reasthope@eastdevon.gov.uk)  
07761 554 638

### Portfolio(s) (check which apply):

- Climate Action and Emergency Response
- Coast, Country and Environment
- Council and Corporate Co-ordination
- Communications and Democracy
- Economy
- Finance and Assets
- Strategic Planning
- Sustainable Homes and Communities
- Culture, Leisure, Sport and Tourism

**Equalities impact** Low Impact

**Climate change** Low Impact

**Risk:** Low Risk

## Links to background information

Link to [Council Plan](#)

Priorities (check which apply)

- Better homes and communities for all
  - A greener East Devon
  - A resilient economy
- 

## Report in full

### 1 - Context:

Car parking provision is fundamental to reducing road network congestion, facilitating economic prosperity and supporting the delivery of Council services through income generated by car parking charges. EDDC offer nearly 5,000 spaces across 53 car parks, including 40 EV charging and 147 disabled bays. Car parking land is in consistently high demand, whether that be for its primary purpose, or for alternative proposed uses, including development, commercial or to meet other Council priorities.

The introduction of an EDDC Parking Strategy would represent a commitment to defining and delivering the right balance between financial and non-fiscal priorities, and set a framework that guides future policy and decision making as well as the underpinning the day-to-day operational work of the Parking team. An agreed parking strategy would also reduce the frequency at which ad-hoc decisions needed to be made on parking matters, on the basis that they would routinely be made in accordance with the strategic direction set for the service. A recent example of this would be a motion put forward to Full Council for EDDC to set a commitment to “offer cash as a parking payment method until 2027”, if the strategy defined that we would offer “as many payment methods as possible”, then a decision would only need to be made at the point of a payment method becoming unviable/phased out.

A published strategy document would imply a financial commitment to delivering an agreed service standard, as well as expectations in relation to the progression of the service over an agreed time period.

### 2 – Draft principles and objectives

The draft principles and objectives below, set out what the parking service aspires to deliver, and the broad methodology that supports it. These were produced in internal consultation with the existing parking team. These are the bare-bone commitments, and a final Parking Strategy would be much more comprehensive, and set out the strategy direction of the service in more detail.

As a decision making template, there may be times at which the strategy is contradictory or at odds with itself, this could be avoided if the guiding principles were prioritised in terms of their relevance/importance to EDDC. There is also an opportunity to set new commitments now that will remain relevant throughout the lifetime of the strategy period.

The strategy period has been set through two political terms for consistency and continuity, with the expectation that the ban on the sale of petrol and diesel vehicles in 2030 may be a catalyst for widespread change in the parking industry.

The draft Parking Strategy principles are service specific and broadly align with the current East Devon District Council Plan. It should be assumed that the Principles and Objectives below are ultimately intended to meet and deliver the overarching strategic plan for the Council as a whole.

East Devon District Council – Car Parking Strategy – 2024-2031



East Devon District Council - Car Parking Strategy - 2024 - 2031			
Guiding principle		Objectives	
1	To provide safe, suitable and accessible parking spaces for East Devon residents and visitors.	1.1	Ensure our car parks and perimeters are well maintained
		1.2	Provide clear signage and easy to operate machines
		1.3	Offer multiple car park payment options that consider the needs of all users
		1.4	Offer sufficient dedicated disabled spaces where they are needed most
		1.5	Ensure car park markings and directional arrows are clear and concise
		1.6	Be vigilant and responsive to unauthorised use of Council car parks
2	To set parking charges that are cohesive and reflective of the location and use of our car parks.	2.1	Regularly review car park usage and capacity to ensure the suitability of tariffs
		2.2	Consider local need and actively consult when considering tariff amendments
		2.3	Adapt to changes in car park usage over time to ensure they continue to best meet local need
		2.4	Ensure parking charges support third party/concessionary arrangements in achieving their intended purpose
3	To embrace new technology and changes in legislation to the benefit of all car park users	3.1	Openly explore new payment and management technologies, whilst considering the rural nature of parts of East Devon
		3.2	Work closely with nearby local authorities to maintain a level of consistency across Devon and facilitate the sharing of best practice
		3.3	Seek to trial new products and services as opportunities arise
4	To actively encourage tourism and ensure the long-term economic sustainability of our towns, coastline and shopping areas	4.1	Operate a clear events pricing structure, that encourages car park use to support local events
		4.2	Explore seasonal and car park specific discounts and concessions to boost local shopping trips
		4.3	Facilitate overnight stop-overs where appropriate, providing the necessary facilities to protect our natural environment
		4.4	Ensure the availability of car parking spaces through an appropriate pricing and permit offer
5	To play our part in encouraging and supporting the transition to Electric Vehicles, whilst considering the non-fiscal potential of our car parks in achieving Net-Zero by 2040	5.1	Use available space within our car parks to help meet local and visitor electric charging needs
		5.2	Consider proposals for shared mobility and sustainable travel where car parks are the best option to deliver this
		5.3	Fully transition the Civil Enforcement Officer fleet to Electric Vehicles
		5.4	Consider emissions based charging and permits to encourage EV use
		5.5	Replace car parking lighting with low energy alternatives
		5.6	Consider alternative usage for "dead" spaces and verges within our car parks
6	Proactively explore commercial ventures and opportunities that will provide additional value to our car parking offer	6.1	Encourage proposals for alternative use of Council car parks that will provide local & public benefit
		6.2	Identify available EDDC land that could be used for additional car parking
		6.3	Offer EDDC car parking enforcement and management services to third-parties when introducing new car parks/enforcement schemes
		6.4	Actively engage in wider projects that will impact on car park usage and demand
7	Provide an efficient, responsive and flexible car parking service that actively enhances the reputation of the Council as a whole	7.1	Meet all statutory deadlines for returns, requests for information and parking correspondence
		7.2	Provide an excellent level of customer service to all customers, regardless of how they choose to contact us
		7.3	Ensure our Civil Enforcement Officers act as Council ambassadors and are helpful and approachable at all times
		7.4	Proactively provide regular updates to interested parties on car parking matters
		7.5	Use management information to identify trends and inform future policy and decision making
		7.6	Work with other services and partners to holistically resolve issues that occur within our car parks, including ASB and environmental crime.
		7.7	Form and maintain excellent relationships with 3rd party suppliers and the industry network
		7.8	Offer online information and systems that are accessible and intuitive
		7.9	Be a point of support and referral for those seeking debt or other assistance from Council services

### 3 – Next steps

If agreed, or where amended, a Parking Strategy document will be produced and publicised, detailing the priorities and objectives for the Parking Service over the agreed timeframe. This will include more detail on all of the objective points, including supplementary facts and figures that explain our current parking offer, and the rationale for the strategy objectives.

This document will become publically available, and a point of reference for future decision making.

**Financial implications:**

No direct comment to be made

**Legal implications:**

There is no direct comment to be made in relation to this initial strategy report, each and any individual issue will need to be considered as it arises at a later date.

Report to: Cabinet

Date of Meeting 1 November 2023

Document classification: Part A Public Document

Exemption applied: None

Review date for release N/A



## A review of the StreetScene bin collection service and town and parishes' service charges

### Report summary:

The review of the StreetScene bin collection service has examined the council's litter, recycling and dog collection service charges and operational model.

- An increase in operating costs requires an uplift in service charges that are consistent charges across the district.
- The review has started looking at alternative operational models which follows national trends and internal and external challenges, and has identified the need for further future strategic planning.
- An electronic map of the bins locations has been produced to provide management information and support future planning.
- The anticipated population growth in Cranbrook, the proposed new town and the wider district will significantly impact on the delivery of the bin collection service and further work is required to develop a strategic plan with stakeholders.

### Is the proposed decision in accordance with:

Budget Yes  No

Policy Framework Yes  No

### Recommendation:

1. Cabinet to endorse the continuation of the current litter and dog bin collection service whilst further strategic options are considered.
2. Cabinet to agree to increase all town and parish service charges to £4.00 per litter bin collection which will be spread over two years to reduce the impact on customers.
3. QR codes to be introduced on all litter, dog and recycling bins to improve quality management.
4. Further work will be undertaken to explore alternative models and working relationships between StreetScene Operations and Recycling and Waste as part of the SUEZ contract replacement work which is currently underway.
5. StreetScene Operations to develop a strategic plan to manage the anticipated population growth in Cranbrook, the proposed new town and the wider district.
6. The Strata project to provide StreetScene Operations with an appropriate software package to manage its operations efficiently is prioritised.

## Reason for recommendation:

### StreetScene Service Plan Objective 5 - Review of the collection model for street litter bins and dog waste bins and the charges

- Bring about a more equitable scheme of charges for such services, which cover delivery costs.
- Appraise the various models of collection and charges a clearer and more equitable charging schedule across the district where we provide such services.

Officer: David Snape, StreetScene Project Officer and Andrew Hancock Assistant Director - StreetScene

---

Portfolio(s) (check which apply):

- Climate Action and Emergency Response
- Coast, Country and Environment
- Council and Corporate Co-ordination
- Communications and Democracy
- Economy
- Finance and Assets
- Strategic Planning
- Sustainable Homes and Communities
- Culture, Leisure, Sport and Tourism

**Equalities impact** Low Impact

**Climate change** Medium Impact

**Risk:** Medium Risk; Failure to prepare and plan for future growth could lead to a degradation of service standards and inefficiency and budget pressure. The current service charges are not consistent across the district and there is a risk of inequity. A revision in the charges will result in some customers incurring higher charges with potential reputational damage.

### Links to background information

- [StreetScene's Main Annual Budgets 2023/24](#)
- [Streetscene Bin Product Range – June 2023](#)

Link to [Council Plan](#)

Priorities (check which apply)

- Better homes and communities for all
- A greener East Devon
- A resilient economy

---

## Report in full

### Baseline Data

1. There are 762 litter and 71 recycling bins in the district that are emptied by the StreetScene operatives. There are 396 dog bins that are emptied by Suez.
2. The cost of the dog bin collections is included in the domestic bin collection service contract for household bin and recycling collections, which is managed by Recycling and Waste.
3. The frequency of bin collections ranges from once a week in rural areas to three collections per day on the Exmouth Esplanade during the summer.

### Dog Bin Collections

4. Dog waste is mixed with non-recyclable waste when it is taken to the Energy From Waste (EFW) facility in Exeter, as EFW do not accept unmixed dog waste.
5. There are 3 full-time Suez operatives emptying the dog bins and there is no provision to cover holiday, sickness from the Recycling and Waste workforce. This will lead to inconsistent collections and an increase in complaints.

## Service Charges

### Dog Bin Collections

6. Dog bin costs are currently linked into the overall SUEZ contract. The cost per collection will be reviewed as part of the contract replacement work, which has recently started within the Recycling and Waste Team. As part of this work, we will also review the best place for the dog bin collection service to sit within the council.
7. The Portfolio Holder report rates set out below are based on 3 dog bin collections per week and are charge pro-rata as required. These charges are reviewed every year as part of our annual charges review and we will continue in this way until contract replacement.
8. The rate equates to £2.12 per collection and is lower than the proposed new litter bin collections and we intend to address this rate during SUEZ contract replacement.

#### CHARGES 2023-24

	2020-2021	2021-22	2022-23	2023-24
Additional Waste Collections (10 bags)	£40.00	£42.00	£45.00	£47.00
<b>Dog Bin Collections for Parish Councils (per bin)</b>	<b>£260.00</b>	<b>£270.00</b>	<b>£300.00</b>	<b>£330.00</b>
Green Waste (annual)	£48.00	£48.00	£48.00	£50.00

9. Members to consider applying the proposed increase to the litter bin collection rate to the dog bin collections. Dog bin collection costs are included in the Suez contract and so are more complex to extrapolate, but based on our own measures of collection costs and because we are entering a cost-plus arrangement with Suez it would seem prudent to increase collection charges to ensure the council is covering costs. Alternatively, more work can be undertaken in preparation for contract replacement in 2026.

## Litter Bin Collections

10. The 2023/24 bin collection charge to town and parish councils is £110 per bin per year (£2.12 per collection). This is based on an historical cost with annual inflation uplifts and bears no relation to our actual service costs.
11. Cranbrook Town Council (CTC) is charged £5.00 per bin collection, based on 29 bins located on unadopted land. This charge is based on two collections per week, but three collections are made each week to deal with the volume of waste. This reduces the weekly charge to £3.45 per bin collection.
12. The Cranbrook Town Council collections were priced at a level to achieve full cost recovery. The charge to other town and parish councils does not cover costs and this has led to the imbalance between what Cranbrook and other town and parish councils pay.
13. StreetScene Operation's services charges have not been previously benchmarked and the council recognises that they have been artificially low for many years.
14. Local district councils were approached to participate in a benchmarking exercise, but have failed to respond. During the next stage of the project, benchmarking will be extended further to enable comparisons to be made.

## Service Delivery Costs

15. StreetScene's main [annual budgets](#) 2023/24:
  - Labour salaries, including superannuation: £1,333,200
  - Vehicles and associated costs for cleansing, excluding sweepers: £172,022
16. We have reviewed the Cranbrook Town Council service costs and established that current service charges do not cover the cost of delivering the service. Labour charges are based on the lowest hourly paid to an operative and do not include oncosts for pensions, holidays and sickness pay. Fuel is included, but there is no allowance for vehicle purchase or lease costs, maintenance costs, PPE or equipment and management costs.
17. Based on 2023/24 salaries, the service charge will need to increase to [£4.00 per collection](#) to cover operating costs. This will need to be applied to all town and parish councils from April 2024 to ensure costs are covered and are consistent charging across the district. To mitigate the impact of the increase that the charge is increased over two years + RPI.

Council	Dog Bins	Litter Bins	Frequency Weekly	Total Collections	23/24 Total Recharge	Charge per collection 23/24	24/25 Total Recharge	25/26 Total Recharge
Town A	0	4	1	208	£440.00	£2.12	£636.48	£832.00
<b>CHARGES</b>	<b>2023/24</b>	<b>2024/25</b>	<b>2025/26</b>		Charge per collection 23/24	Charge per collection 24/25	Charge per collection 25/26	
<b>1 x weekly</b>	£110.00	£159.12	£208.00		£2.12	£3.06	£4.00	
<b>2 x weekly</b>	£220.00	£318.24	£416.00					
<b>3 x weekly</b>	£330.00	£477.36	£624.00					

## **A Combined Litter And Dog Waste Collection Model**

18. A combined waste collection model would see the removal of all the dog bins in the district and the dog waste collected in the black litter bins, which is already happening in many of areas in the district.
19. Although this model would remove the need for a separate dog waste collection service, significant additional capital investment will be required to install larger litter bins if the dog bins are removed.
20. Throughout the district there are many bins that cannot be easily accessed by the collection vehicles, which requires the operatives to carry the litter long distances to their vehicles. The additional weight of dog waste will make this impractical in these locations and will require bins to be relocated. Dog waste is heavy and will significantly increase the total weight of the waste in the bins. There are 768 litter bins in the district that may need relocating or replacing in order to manage the larger volume of combined waste.
21. More vehicles with side-lifts will be required to tip the wheelie bins into the vehicle to reduce manual handling issues. These vehicles are leased at a cost of £54,000 per vehicle over 6-years.
22. The review has considered the costs and benefits of introducing a combined waste pilot to evaluate an alternative operating model. It is estimated that the setup costs of a pilot project would be over £13,300 to replace the existing 19 bins with 14 larger bins. The average cost of installing a replacement bin would be approximately £951.
23. Based on this pilot costings, if the council was to replace the current 768 litter bins the total cost would be approximately £730,000. It is anticipated that not every bin would need replacing, but designated barbeque areas will incur additional costs as these bins require steel internal casings to prevent fire damage from hot barbeques.
24. An existing vehicle with a side-lift could be used during a pilot to lift the wheelie bins, but additional staff may be required to deal with extra collections. Additional vehicles will be required if this model is introduced throughout the district.
25. Due the high setup costs, it is recommended that a pilot is not progressed. As the existing litter bins can be used to collect dog waste, there is limited benefit in removing the dog bins and installing larger litter bins. The council should promote that any bin can be used for general litter and dog waste and larger litter bins installed to replace existing bins if required.

## **Alternative Service Delivery Options**

26. Local authorities are facing the challenges of external factors which include the legislative outcomes of the Environmental Act 2021 and market drivers. Many are looking to alternative models that can bring together existing services such as Recycling & Waste and StreetScene. There are 3 main models available to the council:
  - In-house delivery
  - Outsourced delivery
  - Local Authority Trading Company
27. It is suggested that a Portfolio Holder Leader team be convened to take forward the preparation work to consider the best future option for EDDC.

## **Bin Mapping And Software**

28. As part of this review the location of all of the council's bins have been mapped and this information is now available on the eMap system.

29. Next year a QR code and ID number will be added to every bin to enable members of the public to report damaged and full bins via the council's website.
30. During the bin mapping exercise it became apparent that a management system is required to monitor operatives' time, volume of work and the resources required to meet demand. There is a job in Strata's unrefined backlog of projects which came from an earlier project circa 2017 to converge the 3 council partners' software to manage their public realm cleansing.
31. It is recommended that this work is restarted to ensure our systems are as efficient as possible and provide the evidence based needed for alternative models of operations.

## **Bin Products**

32. There is a diverse mixture of bin products throughout the district and many of the bins have been installed incorrectly or in the wrong location, causing difficulties when emptying the bins.
33. StreetScene Operations has introduced a [new range of bin products](#) for the town and parish councils to choose from when requesting new bins. At present, StreetScene Operations do not have capacity to increase the number of bins, but stage 2 of the project will present policy suggestions for members to consider.
34. All new bins will be installed by StreetScene Operations, who will look to work with the town and parish councils to ensure new bins are installed in appropriate locations for collections.

## **Cranbrook**

35. The anticipated population growth in Cranbrook will significantly impact on the delivery of the StreetScene Operation's services. It is proposed that the next stage of the project considers the future strategic direction of the service in Cranbrook to address the operational issues identified during the review.
36. The council has already changed and adapted its Recycling and Waste service to allow capacity for growth in Cranbrook and StreetScene Operations will adopt a similar approach for its services.
37. StreetScene Operations currently operates out of the Exmouth and Sidmouth depots. It is recognised that lost time and travel costs would be reduced if StreetScene Operations had a premises in the Cranbrook or Honiton area. StreetScene Operations is working with Property, Asset and Commercialisation Team to identify further depots locations throughout the district as part of the depot review to meet operation need into the future

---

## **Financial implications:**

Financial implications are included within the report giving detail of the cost recovery position and providing an equitable pricing solution. With any further strategic options review the cost recovery position should be maintained including covering the cost of any required capital investment.

## **Legal implications:**

The legal implications are dealt with in the body of the report.



**EAST DEVON DISTRICT COUNCIL****Minutes of the meeting of Scrutiny Committee held at Online via the Zoom app on 9 June 2022****Attendance list at end of document**

The meeting started at 6.00 pm and ended at 8.48 pm

**1 Public speaking**

There was one member of the public registered to speak.

Mr Mike Goodman spoke concerning car parking petitions (item 7 refers). As part of his statement, Mr Goodman called into question the grounds on which some signatories had been excluded from the petition. He also thanked the Monitoring Officer for his work in trying to resolve the matter but understood that senior unnamed Cabinet members had decided that the petition would not be heard at Cabinet, on the grounds that a decision had already been taken. He argued that this was undemocratic and unconstitutional.

The Monitoring Officer responded that with the car parking strategy having reverted to Cabinet, the car parking petition was a matter for Cabinet to deal with. Senior members had felt it was not an appropriate time for the petition to be considered by Cabinet given that the budget had already been set, and there was in any case a commitment to review the matter later in the year. This decision did not constitute a breach of the rules.

The Chair thanked Mr Goodman for his contribution to the meeting.

**2 Minutes of the previous meeting**

Minutes of the previous meeting held on 7 April 2022 were received and noted as a true and accurate record.

**3 Declarations of interest**

There were no declarations of interest.

**4 Matters of urgency**

There were no matters of urgency.

**5 Confidential/exempt item(s)**

There was one item to be considered in private session (minute 9 refers).

**6 Decisions made by Cabinet called in by Members for scrutiny in accordance with the Overview and Scrutiny Procedure Rules**

There were no decisions made by Cabinet called in by Members for scrutiny.

**7 Car parking petitions**

The Monitoring Officer introduced his report detailing a petition submitted in relation to car parking charges in Sidmouth and the Council's formal response. One of the organisers of the petition had requested a review of the way it had been handled in accordance with the Council's petition scheme rules, and the Committee was asked to determine whether there were any recommendations that it wished to make in relation to the specific petition or the Council's petition scheme or handling of petitions generally.

Discussion of the report included the following points:

- Some members expressed a view that the petition submitted in relation to car parking charges ought to have been accepted for Council debate, on the basis that:
  - at 1469, the number of valid signatories was only just shy of the threshold of 1500;
  - there had been a lot of noise around the issue of car parking charges and it was important to demonstrate that the voices of local people were being listened to;
  - it was possible that some of the signatories that had been discounted on the grounds that a postcode was missing or incomplete might nevertheless work or study in the district and therefore been eligible to sign the petition;
  - given that visitors to Sidmouth were affected by car parking charges, it was argued that they should legitimately be able to sign the petition and not be discounted.
- Other members expressed support for the position taken by the Monitoring Officer in response to the petition, given that:
  - The Monitoring Officer had taken a pragmatic view and erred on the side of generosity in considering the petition; he had done his due diligence in accordance with the rules in place at the time the petition was submitted;
  - It was important that the threshold of 1500 was adhered to because to let some petitions through and not others could leave the Monitoring Officer open to allegations of bias. Parliament also have clear thresholds concerning petitions and the Council should follow the example. If Members want to move the threshold for Council debate, then this should be done by changing the policy.
  - The Council is answerable to its tax payers including those who have businesses in East Devon, which is why only people who live, work or study in East Devon are able to contribute to East Devon petitions. To extend petitions beyond the boundaries of the district would dilute democracy for the people of East Devon.
  - The onus is on the organiser of the petition to ensure that signatories live, work or study in East Devon, and that they supply their full postcode for the purposes of verification; the petition concerning car parking had contained some signatories with only partial postcode, and some signatories that had been discounted were from elsewhere in the country, and overseas.
- Some members indicated that the Council should have its own platform for electronic petitions, with a field directing signatories to input their postcode. It was suggested that the data could be cross-referenced against the electoral roll, for the purposes of verification; a counterview was offered that this would not be appropriate since not everyone eligible to sign a petition would be on the electoral register.
- Other members suggested it was important the Council accepts paper petitions, in the interests of equal opportunities and ensuring the system was accessible to all.
- It was important to promote awareness among the people of East Devon of the ways that they can make their voices heard including by means of petition or public speaking at meetings.

In a vote of Committee members, the following recommendations were made.

#### **RECOMMENDED to Cabinet**

- To consider a petition platform within the Council's website.
- To publicise the council's petition scheme via the Council's weekly press release.

The minutes of this meeting held on 9 June 2022 were subsequently referred back to the Committee for further consideration from the full Council meeting of 20 July 2022.

The Committee further considered the minutes at the meeting held on 8 September 2022 and Committee agreed the following amendment to this minute:

The Committee noted that a written statement had been submitted in advance of the meeting by a member of the public, Mr Richard Eley, by email to Scrutiny Committee members; while the Chair asked that the statement be set out in full in the meeting minutes it was highlighted that the statement has not been seen by the Monitoring Officer, nor discussed by the Committee, and may contain claims that are incorrect.

## 8 **Forward Plan**

The Committee considered a proposal form received from Cllr Mike Allen concerning economic development and employment quality in rural and coastal areas. In discussion, it was clarified that the proposal comprised two issues; the first being a strategic review of policy formulation and the second being a procedural matter about how people can put alternative strategic policies forward. These would be added to the Forward Plan as two separate items for scoping.

Discussion of the Forward Plan included the following:

- Members felt that it was not appropriate for meetings of the Scrutiny Committee to be cancelled or postponed.
- The Committee expected to meet with Portfolio Holders as a critical friend and to hold them to account.
- Some Members expressed disappointment that a further meeting with South West Water (SWW) would not take place until 8<sup>th</sup> September, given that sewage discharges are a live issue, and asked that the Committee seeks to bring the meetings forward. Others indicated that it was more important that the Committee is fully informed and that there is time for SWW to prepare good quality reports. The Chair clarified that the Committee should expect to meet with SWW on or before 8<sup>th</sup> September.
- Some Members were concerned that the use of scoping forms together with the wait for an officer report and subsequent debate is a convoluted process and not an effective way of getting important items onto the Committee's agenda quickly enough. One Member felt it was inappropriate for individual Members to specify on the form what the outcome should be. The Chair expressed it was important to have crisp objectives to ensure good use of officer time, and indicated that he would undertake to look into the process and suggest improvements.

## 9 **Update on outcomes of EELGA Learning Review**

The Monitoring Officer introduced a report which provided an update on actions arising from Personnel Committee's consideration of the East of England Learning Review.

Members discussed the report at length, and wanted the minutes to reflect the Committee's views that the leaking of the Part B report was abhorrent. Members noted the progress being made on the recommendations from the Personnel Committee but felt that no further recommendations were required.

**Attendance List**

**Councillors present:**

M Allen (Chair)  
V Ranger (Vice-Chair)  
J Bailey  
J Bonetta  
A Bruce  
M Chapman  
C Gardner  
S Hawkins  
J Kemp  
D Key  
H Parr  
E Rylance  
J Whibley  
T Woodward

**Councillors also present (for some or all the meeting)**

M Armstrong  
P Arnott  
F Caygill  
P Faithfull  
M Hartnell  
B Ingham  
G Jung  
R Lawrence  
D Ledger  
J Loudoun  
P Millar  
A Moulding  
M Rixson  
J Rowland  
P Skinner  
I Thomas  
T Wright

**Officers in attendance:**

Henry Gordon Lennox, Strategic Lead Governance and Licensing (and Monitoring Officer)  
Rebecca Heal, Solicitor  
Andrew Hopkins, Communications Consultant  
Susan Howl, Democratic Services Manager  
Sarah James, Democratic Services Officer  
Anita Williams, Principal Solicitor (and Deputy Monitoring Officer)

**Councillor apologies:**

O Davey

Chair: .....

Date:



<b>Overview Committee Work Programme 2023 - 2024</b>
--

<b>Proposed date</b>	<b>Topic</b>
TBC – keep under review	Overview Proposal Form and Scoping Template
January 2024	Beach Amenity Management Plan
TBC	Grass cutting in urban areas with the management of re-wilding areas

## EAST DEVON DISTRICT COUNCIL

### Forward Plan of Key Decisions - For the 4-month period: 1 Oct 2023 to 31 January 2024

This plan contains all the Key Decisions that the Council's Cabinet expects to make during the 4-month period referred to above. The plan is rolled forward every month.

Key Decisions are defined by law as "an executive decision which is likely: –

- (a) to result in the Council incurring expenditure which is, or the making of savings which are, significant having regard to the Council's budget for the service or function to which the decision relates; or
- (b) to be significant in terms of its effects on communities living or working in an area comprising two or more wards in the Council's area."

In accordance with section 9Q of the Local Government Act 2000, in determining the meaning of "significant" in (a) and (b) above regard shall be had to any guidance for the time being issued by the Secretary of State.

**A public notice period of 28 clear days is required when a Key Decision is to be taken by the Council's Cabinet even if the meeting is wholly or partly to be in private.**

The Cabinet may only take Key Decisions in accordance with the requirements of the Executive Procedure Rules set out in Part 4 of the Constitution and the Local Authorities (Executive Arrangements) (Meetings and Access to information) (England) Regulations 2012. A minute of each Key Decision is published within 2 days of it having been made. This is available for public inspection on the Council's website <http://www.eastdevon.gov.uk>, and at the Council Offices, Blackdown House, Border Road, Heathpark Industrial Estate, Honiton. The law and the Council's constitution permit urgent Key Decisions to be made without 28 clear days' notice of the proposed decisions having been published provided certain procedures are followed. A decision notice will be published for these in exactly the same way.

This plan also identifies Key Decisions which are to be considered in the private part of the meeting (Part B) and the reason why. Any written representations that a particular decision should be moved to the public part of the meeting (Part A) should be sent to the Democratic Services Team (address as above) as soon as possible. **Members of the public have the opportunity to speak on the relevant decision at the meeting in accordance with the Council's public speaking rules.**

#### Obtaining documents

Committee reports in respect of Key Decisions include links to the relevant background documents. If a printed copy of all or part of any report or background document is required, please contact Democratic Services (address as above) or by calling 01395 517546.

<b>Key Decision</b>	<b>Portfolio (Lead Officer)</b>	<b>Documents to be considered before Cabinet take decision</b>	<b>Whether other documents will be considered before decision taken [Y/N]</b>	<b>Other meetings where matter is to be debated / considered</b>	<b>Date of Cabinet meeting</b>	<b>Part A = Public meeting Part B = private meeting [with reasons]</b>
Towards Zero Carbon Development in the West End: Interconnector Project	Assistant Director Growth, Development and Prosperity				4 October 2023	Part B
Recycling & Waste Contract 3-year extension proposal	Assistant Director StreetScene				4 October 2023	Part B
StreetScene Public Bin Review	Assistant Director StreetScene				4 October 2023	Part A
Review of the Home Safeguard Service	Assistant Director Housing				4 October 2023	Part A
Future delivery of the Housing Task Force	Assistant Director Housing				4 October 2023	Part A
Council Tax – Local Discount for Care Leavers	Assistant Director Revenues, Benefits and CSC			Devon Chief Executives and Leaders	4 October 2023	Part A
Housing Benefit – Modified Scheme	Assistant Director Revenues, Benefits and CSC		N		4 October 2023	Part A



<b>Key Decision</b>	<b>Portfolio (Lead Officer)</b>	<b>Documents to be considered before Cabinet take decision</b>	<b>Whether other documents will be considered before decision taken [Y/N]</b>	<b>Other meetings where matter is to be debated / considered</b>	<b>Date of Cabinet meeting</b>	<b>Part A = Public meeting Part B = private meeting [with reasons]</b>
Updates to Discretionary Rate Relief Polices	Asst Director – Revs, Bens, CSC		N		4 October 2023	Part A
Annual Homelessness Update - update regarding proposed cuts to Devon County Council Homelessness Budget	Assistant Director Housing				29 November 2023	Part A
Approval of Homelessness and Rough and Sleeper Strategy 2024-2028	Assistant Director Housing				29 November 2023	Part A
Beach Amenity Management Plan	Assistant Director StreetScene				3 January 2024	Part A
Council Tax Reduction Scheme 2024/25	Asst Director – Revs, Bens, CSC				29 November 2023	Part A
Council Tax Base 2024/25	Asst Director – Revs, Bens, CSC				03 January 2024	Part A

Members of the public who wish to make any representations or comments concerning any of the Key Decisions referred to in this Forward Plan may do so by writing to the Leader of the Council c/o Democratic Services (as above).

September 2023

# Proposal form for items for consideration by Overview Committee



Submitted by: Cllr Mike Goodman

Date submitted: 1 September 2023

Item for Consideration: For Overview to receive an update on the implementation of the new public toilet strategy and to review the direction of travel.

Expected outcome (i.e. new policy, new action, new partnership, improve the performance of other public bodies or of the Council in relation to its policy objectives, performance targets and/or particular service areas):

Priority for matter to be considered (please tick):

High (up to 3 months)	yes
Medium (3 to 6 months)	
Low (over 9 months)	

Basis on which priority has been set:

The suggested item should be included in future programme(s) because: (please tick as appropriate)

a) It is a district level function over which the district has some control	yes
b) It is a new policy area or service area of activity to be developed and introduced	yes
c) It is a policy area which has been required for some time and is due for development	yes
d) It is a major proposal for change	yes
e) It is an issue raised via complaints received	
f) It is an area of public concern	yes
g) It would be of benefit to residents of the district	yes

Which of the Council's objectives does the issue address?:

Is there a deadline for the Council to make a decision? (If so, when and why?):

Council decided in 2021 to develop a new public toilet strategy. The start of the implementation is in 2023 and it is appropriate that Overview reviews the direction of travel and receives an update from their Overview meeting on 25 November 2021.

Members are requested to provide information on the following:-

What do you wish to achieve from the review?:

- Clarification on the new strategy
- Update and time frames to members and residents
- Review of the recommendations made in 2021 by Council

Are the desired outcomes likely to be achievable?:

Yes

Will it change/increase efficiency and cost effectiveness?:

Likely but not certain.

**Additional information** – an explanatory sentence or paragraph to be provided below to support each box which has been ticked:

a) Although not a statutory responsibility, public toilets are an important provision to residents and there are toilets throughout East Devon that the District control.

b) The service, in conjunction with Parish and Town Councils and consultants, have been developing the 2021 proposals.

c) It was agreed after a public consultation to implement change; some has occurred, and 2023/24 will see major changes.

d) It is the biggest change in the provision of public toilets for a number of years.

f) Closure or changes to the public toilets will affect residents and there needs to be a greater understanding of the strategy and timescales.

g) Residents are not aware of the policy, and an update on progress will benefit residents.

Please can you return the completed form to Democratic Services via email to [democraticservices@eastdevon.gov.uk](mailto:democraticservices@eastdevon.gov.uk).

---

#### DEPUTY MONITORING OFFICER COMMENT

This is a topic available to Overview to scrutinise. The committee should clearly identify the areas that they wish to scrutinise to ensure that officers can provide reports and information to assist.

Date: 25 September 2023